

NOTES ON THE CASE STUDY CONDUCTED IN THE WORKSHOP BY OCTOBER 14.

Case Studies

Case 1

Figen is a 42 year old married woman. She has a 15 year old son and 2 year old daughter. Figen is a housewife. Her police officer husband Mahmut does not permit Figen to go out and meet her friends and family. He beats Figen and the children for different reasons. One day, Mahmut realizes that Figen is talking to her family secretly and threatens her. He tells Figen that he would get children's custody and never allow her to see them. He threatens Figen to turn her life into a nightmare if she fails in doing what he says and involves her family in their household matters. Eventually Figen runs from home. She wants to stay with her family but the family tells that they would accept her only if she leaves her children. Figen contacts with an advice center she finds through the internet while she was staying at a friend's home for a few days and visits this center. Figen says she has nowhere to stay and she does not want to leave her children in any way. She also tells she does not want to make a complaint because she is afraid by reason that her husband is a policeman, she wants to get divorced and demand alimony.

Intervention plan advices within the framework of attendees for above case;

- Protection order may be issued for the fifteen year old child.
- The father may easily reach to the mother and children because of his job. As a precaution for this, confidentiality order may be issued about them.
- The woman does not want to make a complaint about her husband in the story. Instead, she wants to get divorced and demand alimony.
- The two year old child may move in a guest house (place of refuge) with the mother.

Here, renting a house for the woman and children was advised. However, it is not a right way to rent a house and settle the mother and children there in the first stage for this case by considering that renting a house in the first stage is risky for the cases which have a serious life safety risk. One attendee presents an opinion as follows: The father is a policeman, so I would not take the risk of renting a house for this case. I think the best solution is to settle the mother and little child in a place of refuge and settle the fifteen year old son in a home of love (Sevgi Evi).

The age of fifteen year old son may be tolerated to ensure that both children are welcomed in the place of refuge. Children should live with the mother at least they complete their eight years education. In the same way, the child may stay with his mother till he completes his education for this case. Women coming together with their child should be separately cared about.

Places of refuge were discussed based on this case. An attendee says that women may sometimes move in the places of refuge for different purposes, for example to collect sex workers and employ them as an on call sex worker. An attendee from Ankara Metropolitan Municipality objects to this by saying that she has never encountered such a situation. However, being aware of the existence of such examples based on the cases previously reported, other attendees share this information: Women are collected from places of refuge by being encouraged with the expression "This job makes good money, you should also do this" and this leads up them to be a sex worker.

Another attendee from Çankaya Municipality, Place of Refuge for Women shares her opinion about the institution she still works in as follows: There is some kind of flexibility in Çankaya place of refuge, women feel them more free here. The latest time to enter in the place of refuge is 11 p.m., there are smoking rooms, the rules are more flexible, employees are usually good humored etc. In spite of this, we made an operation for two times. Some cases of on call sex work may occur, we caught out for two times.

Another attendee: Women may walk around with underwear and this may set a bad example for children. In this context, extra care should be taken to accept children in these institutions.

An attendee from Yenimahalle Place of Refuge: The institution we work is a four-storey large facility. Large facilities may be advantageous but at the same time may have some disadvantages. It may be difficult to supervise and control everywhere in case of a large facility, and this may cause abuse. Both girls and boys may be in danger separately.

In addition to this, different attendee opinions are as follows;

- The most proper way is to provide a place where the mother and children would stay together.
- If there is a large number of children in the institution, that may cause disorder.
- Children may play sexually explicit games with each other.
- Children may be exposed to sexual abuse.

There is a divergence between international conventions, legal mechanisms and internal law with respect to the procedure of acceptance in places of refuge. In the *Council of Europe Convention on Preventing and Combating Violence against Women and Domestic Violence* also known as the Istanbul Convention, the term "girl" is used for age 15-18 and also the word "woman" is used for gender emphasis. Shelters are mixed in Turkey, there is no separation for LGBTİ, elderly women, sex workers etc. Decomposed place of refuge model is applied in some countries like Finland, the Netherlands, Denmark, for example LGBTİ individuals stay in a different place in this model. Here the following question may be asked: May any woman be a role model for other women in the shelter?

Sex work is forbidden but brothels are legal in Turkey. In case the brothels are closed, appointment to another place is considered. Women start working with a bill in brothels. The issue of bill can make sense over an example. A woman is married and the husband takes her to a brothel. The woman is given to the boss in return for a bill and the boss pays money to the one who brings the woman. In this way, the woman is indirectly indebted.

Women working in a brothel have sex minimum eight times and maximum fifteen times a day. After the brothels are closed, women start doing sex work on the street but sex work on the street takes part in the law of misdemeanor.

There is a reality of registered of sex workers. Women use the registration practice which brings along marginalization while getting a treatment in sexually transmissible diseases hospital. Any woman who is a registered sex worker may not work as an insured employer. Even though she leaves the brothel, she still keeps doing sex work on the street because she is not employed as insured because of her registration. Moreover, retirement period is also longer for registered sex

workers. On this topic, the article of Şenay Yılmaz who was also an attendee of the workshop published in Kaos Q+ Magazine in April Nisan 2015 named Door of Necessity: The Spatial Order of Sex Work in Ulus After the Demolition of the Brothel (*Mecburiyet Kapısı: Genelev'den Sonra Ulus'ta Seks İşçiliğinin Mekânsal Düzeni*) is advised as a reading, that is expected to be published as a book in Dipnot Publishing House.

Case 2

Zeynep is 15 years old and has taken refuge in Turkey after escaping from war in Syria. She was forced into marriage by her father with a man named Ismail as a Republic of Turkey citizen with religious marriage in Kayseri in return for a bride price. Ismail continuously rapes Zeynep and starts forcing her to have sex with other men in time. Zeynep calls her family that returned back to Syria and tells the situation. However, the family does not believe their daughter and tells her she must continue the marriage under all circumstances. One day, Zeynep runs from home, spends the night on street, then police notices her, takes to police office and takes her testimony. Then they call her family living in Syria. The father immediately asks them to turn over Zeynep to Syria but Zeynep is hesitant. Zeynep has no ID card or a similar certificate.

The attendees are asked whether or not above given case is a human trafficking. The answers may be classified as follows: Yes, this is a case of human trafficking because marriage by force has taken place and the woman has been moved from Syria to Turkey against payment, indeed there is a case of bride price. No, this is not a case of human trafficking because bride price is a traditional practice and there is a marriage story that has taken place with a ceremony.

The attendees have such opinions but marriage by force has been included in scope of human trafficking with the latest regulations, above given case is also relevant with this and it is a case of human trafficking. If the age of victim of the story is taken into account, it may be characterized as a child trafficking. The perception that human trafficking has to take place cross-border is false. Exploitations against body and labor of an individual without her/his consent for the purpose of generating benefit such as money etc. are included in this scope. Any disturbance in routine order of an individual is a sufficient criterion for human trafficking. The victim is below 18 years old, for that reason ex officio decision may be taken and a protection order may be issued about her by considering the principle of the best interests of the child. Some advices were suggested such as issue of a protection order by discussing the matter with the Ministry of Family and Social Policies, taking criminal actions against the husband and father by discussing the matter with the Ministry of Justice, ensuring execution of the procedures related with documents and identification by discussing the matter with the Ministry of the Interior, Foreigners' Department.

Case 3

Gökçe is a 21 year old university student who stays with her family in Samsun. She sees a psychologist by reason of panic attacks she is suffering. She tells the psychologist as a result of the interviews held for one and a half year that she has been exposed to sexual harassment by her father since her 14 year old, and has been raped for the last two years. The psychologist directed

Gökçe to ŞÖNİM (Violence Prevention and Monitoring Center). Gökçe tells in the interview held with the social worker at ŞÖNİM that she does not want to make a complaint about her father because she is afraid but she cannot stay at home any more, and her family does not allow her to stay anywhere else. The members of profession working at ŞÖNİM take over the responsibility as officers and file a criminal complaint even though Gökçe has not given consent. The father is sued. Gökçe begins staying in a place of refuge. Having been called to give statement by the Police, Gökçe attempts to suicide.

Intervention plan advices within the framework of attendees for above case;

- The implementation applied in the fastest and most frequent way possible is the restriction from home among temporary injunctions. The victim has been put under protection by means of restriction from home, restriction order may be issued for other children in the family, if exist, in order to prevent them from being exposed to incest.
- Moreover, the protection order includes the woman and her neighborhood.
- In scope of the case, the concept of 'informed consent' mentioned in *the Law on Protection of Family and Prevention of Violence Against Woman No. 6284* and *Council of Europe Convention on Preventing and Combating Violence against Women and Domestic Violence* also known as the Istanbul Convention is discussed. Accordingly, the existing situation is told, possible results are predicted and the victim is asked whether or not she/he approves and then her/his signature is received, this situation is included in the literature as informed consent.
- The victim gets exhausted in the course of her interviews with psychologist and social service expert within the process, for this reason giving a statement at court or police forces is a psychologically coercive situation.
- A risk evaluation should be conducted in certain intervals because a suicide attempt has taken place.

Based on the above given case, it is evaluated whether restriction from home is useful or not. The child should be restricted from home in incest cases, actually this is some kind of a punishment. The child may reject the institution and so be pushed into street. Some negative consequences may arise upon rupture of family bonds.

Case 4

Hayriye is a 38 year old woman with 3 children living in Bingöl. She wants to leave home because she cannot stand violence of her husband and his family. The woman's own family does not support her by saying that she is now owned by her husband's family. Hayriye could not take it any more and moved to Istanbul with her five year old little daughter. She files a divorce lawsuit. In the meantime, the husband injures Hayriye by attempting to murder her and then stays in prison for four years. During this period of four years, Hayriye firstly stays in a place of refuge for a short time, then starts receiving rent allowance. Staying in a place of refuge is difficult, because her little daughter is physically handicapped. Her identity details are changed. She has been recently informed that her husband got out of the prison and is now seeking after her. Moreover, Hayriye's brother calls her

and tells that family council has met and made a declaration of death about her and two people already started to search her. Worrying about her and her daughter's life, Hayriye applies to settle in the place of refuge again but she is told that there is no danger present because her identity details have already been changed, so she is rejected by the shelter. Hayriye wants to have plastic surgery and change her face as a last resort.

The matter of identity change has been discussed based on above given case. Changing identity is a legal right according to Article 4/1-ç in scope of the Law on Protection of Family and Prevention of Violence Against Woman No. 6284. Following opinions have been declared with respect to identity change based on the case:

- A new protection order should not be issued after the identity change. This would cause disclosure again.
- According to information shared by an attendee, there is only one female cop dealing with identity change procedures in the police department. There is no team which might support victim women to establish a new life and only single female cop cannot be sufficient for all cases. The commissioned police states that she is tired of this situation.
- Some troubles may be experienced if the child's identity is also changed in addition to woman. After the identity change, some photos may be shared on social networking, contact numbers are given to relatives so the person is disclosed again and so the story returns to beginning. Women may not realize the seriousness of situation.
- The cases of failure in breaking away from the previous life may occur.
- Some difficulties may be experienced in getting use to the name and new life.
- Possible danger may also be encountered in a new city, and individuals may feel apprehension by the impact of this.

THE NOTES ON THE BANNER AND SHORT FILM WORK PERFORMED IN THE WORKSHOP ON OCTOBER 13.

You can find below the notes with respect to the banner and short film work performed in the workshop held by October 13.

- 1st Banner



Attendees have found the banner disturbing and unattractive. Comments of attendees about the banner are as follows.

→ It both talks about escaping and reminds death.

→ I think there is the theme that if you escape you would die.

→ They have already escaped by dying, they escaped by risking death. The emphasis on every week is offensive.

→ It makes feel desperate. People overlooks this.

- 2nd Banner



- ➔ It is just like a horror film. But I think it cannot be understood in terms of the intensity of violence unless it is made apparent.
- March 8 Violence against woman painting exhibition was opened 2 years ago, the paintings are made by students of girls' vocational school painting department. The paintings to be exhibited were selected by the current governor and he said that the violence shall not emphasized on paintings. He did not permit exhibition of such paintings. Additionally he warned to not talk about this issue.

- 3rd Banner



- She is a highly aestheticized woman. An image is formed on a beautiful woman. Aestheticized women and men are broadcasted in the current movement. For example women wearing shirt and skirt are preferred. A woman with an image that would embrace all segments should be preferred. Another woman looking at this woman should feel that this woman is me. The works alternate in between modernized woman and traditional woman.
- She has a decisive facial expression. It seems as if someone guides her and she is not experiencing the occurrence personally and this is a negative aspect. It seems like the person, advisor has a good command of the issue. I think this is better, others demonstrate pictures of women being exposed to violence seriously by using a heavy injury makeup by means of black eye, blood etc. This picture seems modern and convincing. In this picture the woman is stronger, she is in a decisive position rather than a victim. Struggling is emphasized here. Desperation is seen in other pictures, while this one has hope and gives me the message that violence is an issue that may be struggled.
- I think this is much more positive compare to the first two pictures. Besides, violence is reduced to murder and physical violence in others. There is no distinction here, it just says No to violence and stop keeping silent. This is not an issue women would have difficulty in understanding, it is not necessary to put a picture of woman with black eye to make them understand.

- 4th Banner



- Once a police was calling down a woman in the children's branch directorate, because the woman was a bit bulky and she had no visible scare that indicates she had been exposed to violence. Then the woman took off her shirt and pointed out her back. Her back was black-and-blue. She asked: did you see now?
- Men are hitting on invisible body parts of women while beating them. This is a longstanding reality but it was not so visible in the past. Fathers were beating their daughters like this in the past.
- This is a very impressive image, a famous artist implies that she can also suffer from this by giving such a message. Moreover, violence is not always visible. This is a very good banner.
- 1st short film

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=-IB1POYCdX8>

- It is considered that it would work if we damage the sense of manhood. A real man does not commit violence, this is not manliness. It may be an effective ad for men, for thinking style of men but this statement does not make sense to me.
- This slogan includes the logic how we should approach men, actually this is not a bad intention.
- We have been trying to solve violence with violence since the time of primitive man. A mother may hit her older child by saying "do not hit your sibling". Some statements are used such as "we would break your hand that commits violence against women". Using much more violence while trying to describe violence is also some kind of violence. Seeing such violence images is annoying me.

- 2nd short film

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=SYKGTjZeUCg>

- This is very good and impressive. The issue is treated without using violence. Stressing traditional discourses is very impressive.
- The change in the facing of woman may be impressive but is violence against woman actually a shame of humanity?
- If we consider its extent, yes. The whole responsibility is burdened on women with such discourses like the core of family, "man make houses, woman make homes" etc. and since therefore this is a shame of humanity.
- We all have a share in all kinds of violence as a society. The half of world's population is excluded just because of they are women and this is basically a shame of humanity. This is basically a problem of human rights.
- 3rd short film

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=u6PDQlwf7U8>

- Should we develop a perception completely based on accusing men or could the issue be expressed in a different way? I asked if it is exaggerated at first sight but this is a different point of view and I don't see why not.
- This seems like impossible and even makes me laugh. This does not show violence just in the form of domestic violence, this is comprehensive.
- If I intend to make a video to raise an empathetic thinking, I would also make such a video.
- The woman is considered as a sexual objet in the video, this really attracted my attention, woman is always harassed in some way. I became emotional when I watch the whole video, I found the actors very successful, they are acting as if they have really experienced this situation. This is really successful, any form of violence experienced by women in every field is accomplishedly described. A similar video was previously made on animals.